The State of the Early Childhood Workforce:
Shared and Divergent Challenges Serving
Children from Birth to Age 8

Marcy Whitebook, Ph.D.

June 3, 2016
CEELO 2016 National Roundtable
“Adults who are under-informed, underprepared, or subject to chronic stress themselves may contribute to children’s experiences of adversity and stress and undermine their development and learning.”

“It is through the quality work of these adults that the nation can make it right from the very beginning for all of its children….”

## Educational Attainment of Teachers and Caregivers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>K-12 Teachers</th>
<th>Center-Based Teachers and Caregivers</th>
<th>Listed Home-Based Teachers and Caregivers</th>
<th>Unlisted Home-Based Teachers and Caregivers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Age 0-3 years</td>
<td>Age 3-5 years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school or less</td>
<td></td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some college, no degree</td>
<td></td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate degree</td>
<td></td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s degree or higher</td>
<td></td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: National Survey of Early Care and Education (2013); K-12 Teachers data: Teachers: Preschool through Postsecondary (2015)

Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, 2016
Worthy Work, Still Unlivable Wages
How We Pay The Least to the Teachers We Need the Most

Sensitive Periods in Children’s Brain Development

2014 Salaries of Children’s Teachers

High

Moderate

Low

$75,000

$50,000

$25,000

Child’s Age (Years)

Sources

Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, 2016
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education Level</th>
<th>School-sponsored Median Wage</th>
<th>Head Start-funded, not school-sponsored Median Wage</th>
<th>Public pre-K-funded, not school sponsored or Head Start-funded Median Wage</th>
<th>All other ECE Median Wage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HS or less</td>
<td>$11.80</td>
<td>$10.00</td>
<td>$8.50</td>
<td>$8.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some college, no degree</td>
<td>$13.80</td>
<td>$10.20</td>
<td>$9.40</td>
<td>$9.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Degree</td>
<td>$13.30</td>
<td>$12.20</td>
<td>$9.80</td>
<td>$10.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s Degree or higher</td>
<td>$20.60</td>
<td>$14.80</td>
<td>$15.00</td>
<td>$13.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Absence of Rational Wage Structure + Low Value Accorded to Educational Attainment

Average Annual Salaries for U.S. Teachers with Bachelor’s Degrees or Higher, 2012

- Elementary School Teacher: $56,130
- Kindergarten Teacher: $53,030
- School-Sponsored Pre-K Teacher: $42,848
- Other Public Pre-K Teacher: $33,696
- All Other ECE Teachers Working with Age 3-5: $28,912
- All Other ECE Teachers Working with Age Birth-3: $27,248

Worthy Work, Still Unlivable Wages
How We Pay the Least to the Teachers We Need the Most

My Teacher Helps Me Learn,
But Struggles To Pay For Food

edcenr.al/worthywork
ECE Teachers: I Worry about Having Enough Food for My Family

Teaching staff with at least one child < 18 years: 57%

Teaching staff with no children or with adult children only: 42%

Teaching staff with some college or less: 53%

Teaching staff with an AA degree or higher: 42%
ECE Teachers: I Worry about Having Enough Food for My Family, by Workplace Auspice, Star Rating Level, and Mean Score on Environment Rating Scale (ERS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Workplace Auspice</th>
<th>0%</th>
<th>10%</th>
<th>20%</th>
<th>30%</th>
<th>40%</th>
<th>50%</th>
<th>60%</th>
<th>70%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For-Profit (n=347)</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Profit (n=220)</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public (n=49)</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Star Rating Level</th>
<th>0%</th>
<th>10%</th>
<th>20%</th>
<th>30%</th>
<th>40%</th>
<th>50%</th>
<th>60%</th>
<th>70%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 (n=124)</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 (n=190)</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 (n=302)</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean Score, ERS</th>
<th>0%</th>
<th>10%</th>
<th>20%</th>
<th>30%</th>
<th>40%</th>
<th>50%</th>
<th>60%</th>
<th>70%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt; 5.00 (n=116)</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.00-5.99 (n=391)</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.00+ (n=109)</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Teaching staff classified as ‘worried’ about a particular item indicated that they somewhat to strongly agreed with a given statement, as represented by a 4 or higher on the Likert Scale.
2 The sample was drawn from one state’s for-profit, non-profit, and public early care and education programs. See endnote #91.


Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, 2016
Transforming Early Childhood Jobs
State of the Early Childhood Workforce Initiative: Overview

Index

- Individual state profiles
- Cross-state appraisal

Deeper Dives (stay tuned!):

- Approaches to salary parity for pre-K teachers;
- ECE Workforce Role Stratification by race, ethnicity, and language;
- Cost estimates and financing mechanisms to ensure livable wages and reward educational attainment;
- New minimum wage laws and ECE policy;
- A user’s guide to ECE workforce data sources; and
- Current organizing and advocacy efforts.

Interactive Map
Early Childhood Workforce Index 2016

- Earnings & Economic Security
- Early Childhood Workforce Policies
- Family and Income Support Policies

Stalled  Edging Forward  Making Headway
● 2015 wages:
  ○ Child Care Workers, Preschool, Kindergarten and Elementary School Teachers

● Occupational rankings, including ratio of ECE jobs to median income

● Changes over time 2010 to 2015:
  ○ Child care workers and Preschool Teachers

● Utilization of federal income supports
National Mean Hourly Wages, 2014

Child Care Workers: $10.44
Preschool Teachers: $15.40
Kindergarten Teachers: $25.71

Coming soon: 2015 Update
Selected Occupations, Ranked by Mean Annual Salary

Selected Occupations Ranked by Mean Annual Salary, 2013


**Figure 3.1**: Percentage Change in Real Hourly Wages, by Occupation, 1997 to 2013

- Child care workers: 1%
- Preschool teachers: 15%
- Kindergarten teachers: 7%
- Nonfarm animal caretakers: -3%
- Fast food cooks: 2%
- Tellers, financial services: 6%


Pervasive Economic Insecurity Among ECE Practitioner

Participation Rates in Public Support Programs, by Selected Occupations, and for All Workers and Their Family Members
(Annual Averages, 2007-2011)

Early Childhood Workforce Policies

- **Qualifications/Financial Supports for Education**
  - BA for all Pre-K teachers?
  - At least CDA or equivalent for licensed providers?

- **QRIS and Work Environment**
  - Paid time for professional development?
  - Paid planning/preparation time?
  - Salary schedule/benefits?
  - Consistency across settings?

- **Compensation Initiative**
  - Salary parity for pre-K teachers?
  - Wage supplement?
Financial resources

- State reported extra CCDBG spending
- State applied for federal grant
- Ratio of pre-K to K-12 spending over 50%
Workforce Data: What Can We Answer?

- Formal data collection mechanism?
- Includes compensation?
- Reports data publicly?
- Comprehensive?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income supports and child care assistance</th>
<th>Supports for health and well-being</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>○ Refundable EITC</td>
<td>○ Paid sick days law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>○ Higher than federal minimum wage, indexed for inflation</td>
<td>○ Paid family leave law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>○ Child care assistance income eligibility set at 85% of state</td>
<td>○ Expanded Medicaid eligibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>median income or above</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>○ Refundable child care tax credit?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Belief in the insolvability of the workforce wage problem
“The fact is that most of the biggest catastrophes we have witnessed rarely come from information that is secret or hidden, it comes from information that is freely available and out there, but that we are willfully blind to because we can’t handle, don’t want to handle the conflict it provokes. But when we dare to break that silence, or when we dare to see, and we create conflict, we enable ourselves and the people around us to do our very best thinking.”

-Business Leader Margaret Heffernan’s TED Talk, Dare to Disagree